

University of Toronto
Governing Council

Policies for Librarians

[January 01,
2024]

To request an official copy of this policy, contact:

The Office of the Governing Council

Room 106, Simcoe Hall

27 King's College Circle

University of Toronto

Toronto, Ontario

M5S 1A1

Phone: 416-978-6576

Fax: 416-978-8182

E-mail: governing.council@utoronto.ca

Website: <http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/>

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Preamble | 3 |
| Librarian Responsibilities | 3 |
| Appointments | 4 |
| Secondments | 4 |
| Procedures for Appointment | 4 |
| Rank and Promotion | 5 |
| Ranks | 5 |
| Librarian I | 6 |
| Librarian II | 6 |
| Promotion to Librarian II | 6 |
| Librarian III | 7 |
| Promotion to Librarian III | 8 |
| Librarian IV | 8 |
| Promotion to Librarian IV | 9 |
| Procedures for Promotion to Librarian IV | 9 |
| Denial of Promotion to Librarian III or IV | 10 |
| Appeal for Reconsideration | 10 |
| Procedures for Performance Review and Promotion | 11 |
| Permanent Status | 11 |
| Criteria for Permanent Status | 12 |
| Committees on Permanent Status | 12 |
| Documentation | 13 |
| Procedures | 14 |
| Appeals Against Denial of Permanent Status | 15 |
| Grounds for Appeal | 15 |
| Review Procedures for Appeals | 15 |
| Termination of Appointments with Permanent Status | 15 |
| Contractually Limited-Term Appointments | 16 |
| Research and Study Leave | 18 |
| Appointment of Department Heads and Senior Librarian Administrators | 18 |
| Advisory Committees for Department Heads and Senior Librarian Administrators | 18 |
| Department Heads | 18 |
| Senior Librarian Administrator Appointments | 19 |
| The University Chief Librarian | 19 |
| Acting Appointments | 19 |
| Transitional Provisions | 19 |

Policies for Librarians

Preamble

The University of Toronto Library System (the UTL) is an administratively complex component of the academic community. At present consisting of library units of varying size and with various relationships and reporting structures, it has grown in apparent response to the evolving academic needs of the University. The UTL is committed to upholding the University of Toronto's principles and values on equity, diversity, inclusion and excellence, and these principles shall inform all aspects of the Policies for Librarians (the Policy), including recruitment, hiring, appointment, and promotion.

Librarians, in fulfilling their roles as contributors in the academic process, have a responsibility to provide leadership, initiative and expertise in realizing the goals and objectives of the UTL. Equitable opportunity and the same rank, and salary structure shall apply to all librarians employed by the University of Toronto under this Policy regardless of the reporting structure, or campus, within which they fulfil their responsibilities.

Librarians play an integral role in advancing the mission of the University, and are guided by collegial values, professional and academic standards, service, and a commitment to intellectual and academic freedom.

Librarians participate in collegial processes. To that end, where nominations to library committees are sought, librarians will be given reasonable notification and an opportunity to nominate committee members.

This Policy recognizes and encourages the concept of a University library system, in that it provides equal access to opportunities for librarian development and allows greater mobility and flexibility in staffing across the system as well as consistency in the application of policies across the University. A librarian who is appointed to the University should be made fully aware of the conditions of employment, opportunities for advancement, and specific conditions of the position held. Review and evaluation procedures are prescribed at regular intervals, with substantial review prior to a change in rank or status. The review mechanisms developed emphasize collegial consultation at all appropriate levels, including the concept of peer evaluation.

At the time that a librarian is appointed to the UTL, they shall be provided with this Policy and the Memorandum of Agreement between the University of Toronto and the University of Toronto Faculty Association (MOA), the Workload Policy and Procedures for Faculty and Librarians (WLPP) and the Librarian Workload Policy – University of Toronto.

The autonomy of local UTL units with regard to librarian selection and administration is acknowledged, regardless of campus. At the same time, however, the University Chief Librarian, will take responsibility for the interpretation of the policies and procedures for librarians across the system supported as appropriate by Library Human Resources.

Librarians have access to the grievance procedures under Article 7 of the MOA, subject to the limitations on grievances set out therein and in this Policy.

Librarian Responsibilities

1. Librarian responsibilities are a combination of tasks assigned and tasks determined through collegial interaction and self-direction. While the pattern of a librarian's professional activity may vary from individual to individual, the following three activities constitute a librarian's principal responsibilities:
 - (i) Professional practice as a librarian for the UTL or the University, including teaching that has been requested or approved by a librarian's supervisor(s);

- (ii) Research and scholarly contributions and creative professional activities, including academic, professional and pedagogical contributions; and
 - (iii) Service, which should be broadly understood to include service to the University, the UTL, and the profession, including academic organizations and community partnerships relevant to the mission of the University.
2. Professional practice shall be considered the primary area of responsibility. The same activity may reasonably fall into more than one area of responsibility above.
3. Librarian workload is subject to the WLPP and the Librarian Workload Policy – University of Toronto as those policies may be amended from time to time.

Librarians are also subject to relevant provisions of the MOA as amended from time to time, including librarian responsibilities set out in Article 5 of the MOA.

Appointments

4. There should be a collegial planning process in each area and department with the objective of delineating future plans and development. Against such plans, requests for new appointments can be judged and the nature of candidates to be sought determined. All area or department heads, before seeking approval for an increase in librarian positions or for the filling of a vacant position, should examine fully the possibility of using librarian resources already available in other areas of the University.
5. Notice of vacancy for a librarian's position in any part of the University shall be sent to the Library Human Resources Office, where appropriate posting and advertising is arranged.

Postings for librarian positions in any part of the University shall be distributed to all UTL librarians as well as posted on the University of Toronto job posting website. Postings will normally be advertised widely including throughout Canada and internationally, as appropriate to the nature of the position.

A librarian shall not be excluded from consideration for a position because they hold a higher rank than the advertised position, it being understood that if they are offered and accept the position, they will normally be appointed at the rank, status and salary for the position as advertised.

Secondments

6. The UTL recognizes the desirability of professional and academic growth among permanent status librarians, including endeavouring to provide opportunities for permanent status librarians to work across the UTL where operationally feasible.

Procedures for Appointment

7. Procedures should be adopted to ensure that an adequate list of possible candidates of quality is obtained and that the selection from this list has been properly and effectively carried out by the department concerned.
8. The documentation for each candidate shall include a current curriculum vitae and a list of normally at least three (3) referees from whom appraisals may be obtained indicating the candidate's capacity for librarianship as evidenced by job performance and academic and/or professional activities.
9. These applications shall be assessed and judged by the Search Committee, which will identify a short list of candidates to be interviewed.

10. Normally, short-listed candidates shall be invited to give a presentation. Those invited will include the Search Committee, members of the unit, all UTL staff and librarians, and faculty and students who may be interested. The Search Committee is advisory to the University Chief Librarian or the appropriate academic administrative head in the case of appointments outside the Central Library System. The Search Committee shall provide a recommendation to the University Chief Librarian who will decide. In the case of appointments outside the Central Library System, the Search Committee shall make a recommendation to the appropriate academic administrative head who will make a recommendation to the University Chief Librarian. The Search Committee shall consist of the department head/appropriate academic administrative head or supervisor (acting as the Chair of the Committee). The majority of the Committee shall be librarians who hold permanent status and shall normally include one or more librarian(s) from the relevant department. The majority of Committee members shall be from the relevant campus.
11. The appointment of a librarian outside the Central Library System shall be made by the senior library administrator or appropriate academic administrative head, subject to the approval of the University Chief Librarian.
12. The terms and conditions of each appointment shall be clearly stated and confirmed in writing, including type of appointment, rank, salary, status with respect to permanency, the timeline with respect to consideration for promotion and permanent status (if applicable, having regard to previous work experience), and any special conditions attached to the appointment.
13. Before approving appointments at the ranks of Librarians III and IV with permanent status, the University Chief Librarian shall refer the proposal to a Committee on Permanent Status as described in paragraph (52) for its recommendation. Proposals for appointment at the rank of Librarian III without permanent status shall be referred to a Committee as described in paragraph (30). Proposals for appointment at the rank of Librarian IV without permanent status shall be similarly referred to the Senior Committee on Promotions described in paragraph (35). There shall, however, be no right of appeal against the decision of the University Chief Librarian not to appoint, or to appoint without permanent status.
14. Where a librarian has been appointed at the rank of Librarian III or IV without permanent status they shall normally be reviewed for permanent status within one year of appointment.

Rank and Promotion

15. Librarians in the University of Toronto are appointed to one of the four ranks defined in paragraph (16). At the rank of Librarian III or IV, a librarian may be granted permanent status, which is the holding by a librarian of the University of a continuing full-time appointment which the University has relinquished the freedom to terminate except under the conditions specified in paragraphs (68) and (69). Permanent status shall be granted only by a definite act under the conditions stipulated herein, on the basis of merit.

Ranks

16. Librarians in the University of Toronto are appointed to one of the four ranks (Librarian I, II, III, IV).
17. Advancement through these ranks should reflect increased individual levels of professional achievement, which may be demonstrated either by increased responsibility in an area of specialization or by the discharge of administrative responsibilities, or a combination of both.
18. To qualify for appointment to any rank, the candidate shall have the minimum of an undergraduate degree plus either a master's degree in library, archival or information science from an accredited institution, or equivalent professional education.
19. In exceptional circumstances, the UTL may consider appointing someone who lacks the requisite graduate education, however, a candidate who does not so qualify shall be appointed

conditionally as a librarian and must be accepted and remain enrolled until the graduate degree is conferred, which should normally be within three years. Such candidates will be appointed on a one-year annual contract, which normally may be renewed no more than twice. Successful completion of the degree will make the person eligible for appointment as a librarian without conditions.

20. The basic quality which must be evident for appointment or promotion to a rank is the ability to perform as a librarian at a high professional level in areas which contribute to the teaching and research objectives of the University, such as the selection, acquisition and preservation of UTL materials, the bibliographic control of those materials, the accessibility of the collections to users, the provision of instruction in using the UTL's resources and the planning and development of library systems.

A librarian shall carry out their responsibilities with all due attention to the establishment of fair and ethical dealings with library users, colleagues and staff taking care to be properly accessible. A librarian shall foster a free exchange of ideas and shall not impose nor permit censorship. A librarian shall ensure fullest possible access to library materials.

21. Five criteria form the basis for appointment or promotion to a rank:
 - effective performance in the area(s) of the candidate's responsibility;
 - academic achievement and activities;
 - professional achievement and activities;
 - effectiveness of service to the University, the UTL, and where appropriate, to the profession; and
 - clear promise of continuing growth in overall performance as a librarian.

Performance as a librarian typically includes specialized knowledge and expertise within an area of responsibility.

22. Effective performance in the area(s) of the candidate's responsibility will be considered the primary criterion at the lower ranks (Librarian I and Librarian II). It will also be considered significant at the higher ranks (Librarian III and Librarian IV), but the weighting of the other criteria will increase proportionately.

Librarian I

23. Librarian I is the rank at which a professional career normally begins. In being considered for an appointment to this rank the candidate shall have met the minimum educational requirement, and show both potential for successful performance and promise of future professional and academic activity. Librarian I is a probationary appointment, the term of which shall not normally be less than one year or more than two years.

Librarian II

24. In being considered for appointment or promotion to the rank of Librarian II, the candidate shall have met the minimum educational requirement and shall have at least one year's relevant professional experience or equivalent, normally as a librarian. As a primary criterion for appointment or promotion to this rank, a candidate shall have a record of effective performance in the area(s) of the candidate's responsibility as a librarian. It is expected that successful candidates will have demonstrated the ability to effectively use their professional education and will have shown the capacity and promise to develop and extend their professional and academic expertise. A librarian promoted to this rank shall normally receive a three-year contract. A librarian appointed to this rank may receive a contract for a shorter period where previous experience warrants this, but in no case shall the contract be for less than one year.

Promotion to Librarian II

25. A Librarian I's performance shall normally be reviewed at least twice by their supervisor(s). Review for promotion to Librarian II should normally take place no more than two years after the

candidate's appointment as a Librarian I. A written evaluation shall be prepared by the candidate's supervisor(s) based on the requirements and criterion outlined in paragraph (24), before a recommendation for promotion is made. Promotion in rank from Librarian I to Librarian II is recommended by the supervisor(s) subject to approval of the University Chief Librarian or their designate, who shall be an appointed librarian.

In circumstances where a librarian on a probationary appointment has been reviewed and is found not to meet the criteria for Librarian II and their contract will not be renewed, they shall be notified at least three months prior to the end of the probation period, and their employment shall end in accordance with its terms.

The supervisor(s) shall provide written reasons for their recommendation that promotion be denied and their recommendation shall be subject to appeal to the University Chief Librarian on the following grounds:

- (i) A significant irregularity by the supervisor(s) in the review for promotion; and/or
- (ii) Improper bias or motive on the part of the supervisor(s).

The librarian shall have (twenty) 20 working days from the date of receipt of written reasons for the denial of promotion from the supervisor(s) to file an appeal with the University Chief Librarian.

The decision of the University Chief Librarian of an appeal shall be final and binding and not subject to grievance under the MOA.

Librarian III

26. In being considered for appointment or promotion to the rank of Librarian III, the candidate must submit evidence of continuing effective performance in accordance with the criteria outlined in paragraph (21) of this Policy:

- effective performance in the area(s) of the candidate's responsibility;
- academic achievement and activities;
- professional achievement and activities;
- effectiveness of service to the University, the UTL, and where appropriate, to the profession; and
- clear promise of continuing growth in overall performance as a librarian.

There should be clear promise of continuing professional development and demonstrated ability to handle increased responsibilities in areas of specialization and/or in an administrative capacity.

27. All of the following criteria will also be considered: academic achievement and activities, including additional formal degrees, programmes of continuing education, teaching and other pedagogical contributions or activities, research, peer reviewed and non-peer reviewed publications; involvement in professional activities and participation in professional organizations, including serving on committees, the presentation of papers, organization and participation in conferences, seminars, workshops; and service to the University, the UTL, and the profession, including academic organizations and community partnerships relevant to the mission of the University.
28. To be considered for promotion to Librarian III, with or without permanent status, a librarian shall normally be in the fifth year of an appointment at the University of Toronto.
29. This rank is the normal career rank for librarians. However, all librarians with a minimum of five (5) years of library experience as a Librarian III or equivalent experience are eligible for consideration for promotion to Librarian IV in accordance with paragraph (34).

Promotion to Librarian III

30. For promotion in rank from Librarian II to Librarian III the librarian's performance is reviewed by a Committee on Promotions appointed by the University Chief Librarian in consultation with the department head.

For promotion of librarians employed outside the Central Library System, the appropriate academic administrative head or their designate shall serve on the Committee on Promotions appointed in consultation with the University Chief Librarian, and shall make the appropriate recommendations for promotion.

31. (i) Permanent status stream librarians being considered for promotion in rank from Librarian II to Librarian III, will be reviewed in accordance with the procedures and documentation for consideration for permanent status (paragraphs 48 to 61).

(ii) For externally-funded librarians holding contractually-limited term appointments (CLTAs) who are being considered for promotion, the librarian's performance is reviewed by a Committee on Promotions appointed by the University Chief Librarian in consultation with the department head. It shall be composed of the department head as chair, the University Chief Librarian's appointed librarian designate, and three professional librarians with the rank of Librarian III or above. At least one of these librarians shall be from outside the department concerned and wherever possible at least one should be from within the department.

The candidate should submit their annual activity reports, performance assessments, curriculum vitae, and a list of three external referees. The Committee Chair will obtain assessments of the candidate's work from two referees, one of whom will be from the candidate's list and one of whom will be of the Committee Chair's choosing. Both referees will be arm's length to the candidate and from another institution. In addition, an optional statement prepared by the candidate providing an account of their activities and evidence of their activities as appropriate to the criteria for promotion, set out in paragraphs (26) and (27).

32. A Librarian II shall normally be considered for promotion to Librarian III within three (3) years of the candidate's appointment as, or promotion to, Librarian II. In exceptional circumstances where the candidate's experience warrants, and with the consent of the candidate, such consideration may take place at an earlier agreed upon date.

In exceptional circumstances, extensions may also be granted with the written consent of the candidate, and the approval of the University Chief Librarian and the Vice-President & Provost.

33. A Librarian II will normally be considered for promotion in the final year of their appointment as a Librarian II. A promotion may be granted by the University Chief Librarian or their librarian designate upon the majority recommendation of the Committee.

Librarian IV

34. A librarian may not be considered for appointment or promotion to the rank of Librarian IV until they have had a minimum of five (5) years' library experience as a Librarian III or has had equivalent experience and rank at another institution.

Appointment or promotion to this rank requires evidence of a record of excellent performance with demonstrated initiative, leadership and creativity, and to have established a wide reputation in their area or field of interest. As well as making an outstanding contribution to the UTL and to the University the candidate must submit evidence of substantial and sustained achievement in one or more of the following areas: academic activities including research, publication and teaching; professional endeavours including significant involvement in professional organizations; and service to the University, the UTL, and where appropriate to the profession.

Besides having attained a high level of professional expertise, the candidate should be considered

likely to continue to fulfil a vital role in the institution.

Promotion to Librarian IV

35. For promotion of permanent status stream or externally-funded CLTA librarians from the rank of Librarian III to Librarian IV, the librarian's overall performance is reviewed by a Senior Committee on Promotions appointed annually by the University Chief Librarian in consultation with senior colleagues including colleagues outside the Central Library System. The membership of this Committee shall be made known to all librarians.

The Committee shall be chaired by the University Chief Librarian or appointed librarian designate and shall include four Librarian IVs (including at least one department head, and, wherever possible, at least one Librarian IV without administrative responsibility and also wherever possible include representation from all three campuses), and one member of the faculty who shall hold tenure or continuing status named by the Vice-President & Provost. A promotion may be granted by the University Chief Librarian on the majority recommendation of the Committee.

The quorum of the Committee shall be its full membership.

Procedures for Promotion to Librarian IV

36. The responsibility for compiling and providing documentation to the Senior Committee on Promotions shall rest with the candidate and Committee Chair. Materials for consideration shall include:
 - i. The candidate's curriculum vitae. This should include:
 - a. The academic and professional history of the candidate setting out the degrees obtained with institutions and dates, any honours, prizes or awards obtained, reference to relevant specialist qualifications (*e.g.*, language, subject or area competence), and a record of continuing educational activities in which the candidate may have engaged.
 - b. The record of professional and other relevant employment of the candidate with a brief description of the duties of each position held.
 - c. A list of committees and organizations within the UTL, University and profession, as well as any relevant community committees, on which the candidate has served, with a brief description of the service.
 - d. A list of scholarly and professional work performed by the candidate, with sufficient detail to allow the committee to evaluate its relevance to the decision.
 - ii. The candidate will provide a list of three external referees, all of whom must be at a rank equivalent to Librarian IV. The Committee Chair will obtain assessments of the candidate's work from two referees, one of whom will be from the candidate's list and one of whom will be of the Committee Chair's choosing. Both referees will be arm's length to the candidate and from another institution.

These referees should be able to speak with authority on the candidate's record of excellent performance with demonstrated initiative, leadership and creativity, and the candidate's wide reputation in their area or field of interest. They should also comment on the candidate's sustained achievement in one or more of the following areas: academic activities including research, publication and teaching; professional endeavours including significant involvement in professional organizations; and service to the University, the UTL, and where appropriate to the profession.

- iii. A statement prepared by the candidate providing an account of their activities as appropriate to the criteria for promotion to Librarian IV set out above in paragraph (34).
 - iv. Copies of work that the candidate has completed, or has nearly completed, should be provided, or in the case of non-written work made known in appropriate form, to the Committee Chair. However, the candidate's permission is required before unpublished work may be communicated outside of the Senior Committee on Promotions.
 - v. The candidate's University of Toronto performance assessments and activity reports, normally from the previous five (5) years. Where the candidate elects, they may extend the period from which they are providing performance assessments and activity reports.
 - vi. Assessments of the candidates' work from two referees, at least one selected from the candidate's list and both of whom shall be arm's length to the candidate and from another institution. The referees shall be provided with the candidate's work, curriculum vitae and statement, as well as the criteria for assessment.
37. If the candidate has reason to believe that the proposed Committee members cannot make their decision solely on the basis of evidence available to the Senior Committee on Promotions, they shall immediately advise the University Chief Librarian in writing, who shall maintain confidentiality of the information and determine if a reasonable apprehension of bias or conflict of interest exists.

Where the candidate has a reason to believe that the University Chief Librarian cannot make their decision solely on the basis of the evidence available and the recommendation of the Committee, they should immediately notify the Vice-President & Provost in writing, who shall maintain the confidentiality of the information and determine whether a reasonable apprehension of bias or conflict of interest exists.

38. The Chair of the Senior Committee on Promotions will inform the candidate of the recommendation in their case.

Denial of Promotion to Librarian III or IV

39. In cases where promotion to Librarian III or IV is denied, the candidate will be provided with a written statement of the reasons for such a decision. Where permanent status is also denied with the promotion to Librarian III the procedures for appeals against denial of permanent status (paragraphs 62-67) will be applicable.
40. A denial of promotion to Librarian IV does not preclude a librarian from being considered again in the future.
41. Appeals against the denial of promotion to Librarian III or IV may be launched on either or both of two grounds:
- (i) that the procedures described in this Policy have not been properly followed; and/or
 - (ii) that the performance and/or achievements have not been evaluated fully or fairly.

Appeal for Reconsideration

42. Appeals against the denial of promotion will follow the Grievance Procedure set forth in the MOA, except as follows: at Step No. 2 and Step No. 3, the University Chief Librarian and the Vice-President & Provost respectively will have thirty (30) working days to notify the grievor in writing of the decision; if a grievance which involves promotion contains issues other than promotion, these other issues will also be subject to the time limit of thirty (30) working days at

both the decanal and provostial levels.

Procedures for Performance Review and Promotion

43. Performance will be reviewed annually by the librarian's supervisor(s), who shall prepare a written performance assessment in accordance with applicable assessment procedures. The assessment shall be given to and discussed with the librarian. Such an evaluation will assess the librarian's ability to meet standards of performance in designated areas of responsibility and will give an opportunity to provide feedback to assist them to improve areas of weakness and further develop areas of strength. At the time of each annual review, the librarian's supervisor(s) should assess the librarian's suitability for promotion and may wish to make a recommendation for such a promotion; the librarian concerned may also request consideration for promotion.
44. Where a librarian directly reports to more than one supervisor, those supervisors shall provide input into the annual performance assessment(s), and consideration for promotion.
45. Procedures of all committees on promotions to any rank shall be fully known to librarians. Such procedures should be designed with the aim of eliciting and considering all relevant information.
46. The proceedings and deliberations of all promotions committees, including the Senior Committee on Promotions, are confidential. Each person accepting an appointment to a promotions committee shall agree to treat as confidential all information given to the committee and all matters pertaining to and deliberations of the committee.
47. A librarian may make a written request for a delay in their consideration for promotion based on pregnancy and/or parental or adoption leave or serious personal circumstances beyond their control such as illness or injury. Delays may be granted for one (1) year but not more than two (2) years with the approval in writing of the University Chief Librarian and the Vice-President & Provost. Written requests by a candidate for further delays based on the provisions of the Ontario *Human Rights Code* as amended from time to time (the Code) will be considered by the University Chief Librarian and Vice-President & Provost on a case-by-case basis, it being understood and agreed that such requests must be made by the candidate in writing at the earliest opportunity (*i.e.*, as soon as a candidate knows or reasonably ought to know that their consideration for promotion may warrant a delay based on the provisions of the Code).

The University Chief Librarian and/or the Vice-President & Provost will consult with the supervisor(s) or appropriate academic administrative head before making a decision.

Permanent Status

48. Permanent status for librarians, as defined in paragraph (15), entails the acceptance by a librarian of the obligation to perform conscientiously as a contributor to teaching, learning and scholarship in the University. Librarians who enter the University in the rank of Librarian I shall normally serve a probationary period of no more than two (2) years.

Upon successful promotion to Librarian II they will normally be considered for appointment with permanent status during the third year of service in the rank of Librarian II in the University. Librarians appointed at the rank of Librarian II for a contractual period of up to three (3) years' duration shall be considered for permanent status in the final year of their contracts. Librarians appointed at the ranks of Librarian III or IV, if not granted permanent status on appointment, will normally be considered for permanent status in the first year of service in the University.

49. A librarian may make a written request to their supervisor(s) for a delay in their consideration for permanent status based on pregnancy and/or parental or adoption leave or serious personal circumstances beyond their control such as illness or injury. Delays may be granted for one (1) year but not more than two (2) years, with the approval in writing of the University Chief Librarian and the Vice-President & Provost. Written requests by a candidate for further delays based on the provisions of Ontario *Human Rights Code* as amended from time to time (the Code)

will be considered by the University Chief Librarian and Vice-President & Provost on a case-by-case basis, it being understood and agreed that such requests must be made by the candidate in writing at the earliest opportunity (*i.e.*, as soon as a candidate knows or reasonably ought to know that their consideration for permanent status may warrant a delay based on the provisions of the Code). Where the librarian is outside of the Central Library System, the University Chief Librarian will consult with the appropriate academic administrative head in making the decision.

Criteria for Permanent Status

50. A Librarian II will normally be considered for permanent status in the final year of their appointment as a Librarian II.

Appointments with permanent status should be granted on the basis of the five criteria outlined in paragraph (21) of this Policy:

- effective performance in the area(s) of the candidate's responsibility;
 - academic achievement and activities;
 - professional achievement and activities;
 - effectiveness of service to the University, the UTL and where appropriate, to the profession; and
 - clear promise of continuing growth in overall performance as a librarian.
51. Effective performance in the area(s) of the candidate's responsibility shall be judged primarily, but not exclusively, on the basis of previous annual performance assessments. Academic achievement may be judged by research, peer and non-peer reviewed publications, teaching, and other pedagogical contributions or activities, advanced degrees or completion of other education programmes. Professional achievement may be evidenced by involvement in professional activities and participation in professional organizations, including serving on committees, the presentation of papers, organization and participation in conferences, seminars and workshops. Service to the University, the UTL and the profession is demonstrated by committee work and engagement as well as the preparation of internal studies and reports, and by responsible and effective involvement in the UTL and University activities.

These are not exhaustive examples. Librarians' achievements and activities may vary. Moreover, the categories above are non-exclusive and many activities can reasonably fall into more than one category.

Clear promise of continuing growth in overall performance as a librarian will be judged by the degree to which the candidate has demonstrated progress in librarianship in the period of service preceding consideration for appointment with permanent status.

Committees on Permanent Status

52. A Committee on Permanent Status shall be named for each candidate by the University Chief Librarian in consultation with the department head or the appropriate academic administrative head, and shall consist of the department head or the appropriate academic administrative head (as Committee Chair), the University Chief Librarian or their designate, who shall be an appointed librarian, four librarians having permanent status and holding a rank at least equal to that of the candidate, and one member of the faculty who shall hold tenure or continuing status.

Whenever possible, at least one of the four librarians shall be from the department concerned. At least one shall be from outside the department, and at least two should be librarians holding no administrative position. The University Chief Librarian will provide written notice to the candidate of the proposed membership of their Committee on Permanent Status.

53. If the candidate has reason to believe that any member of their Committee, including the department head, cannot make their decision solely on the evidence available at the time of the Committee on Permanent Status meeting, they should indicate this to the University Chief

Librarian. The University Chief Librarian shall then formally notify the candidate of the final composition of their Committee on Permanent Status.

Documentation

54. The responsibility for compiling and supplying documentation to the Committee on Permanent Status shall rest with the candidate and the Committee Chair. Materials for consideration shall include:
- i. The candidate's curriculum vitae, to be prepared by the candidate with the advice and assistance of the Committee Chair. This should include:
 - a. The academic and professional history of the candidate setting out the degrees obtained with institutions and dates, any honours, prizes or awards obtained, reference to relevant specialist qualifications (*e.g.*, language, subject or area competence), and a record of continuing educational activities in which the candidate may have engaged;
 - b. The record of professional librarianship and other relevant employment of the candidate with a brief description of the duties of each position held;
 - c. A list of committees and organizations within the UTL, University and profession, as well as any academic organizations and community partnerships relevant to the mission of the University, on which the candidate has served, with a brief description of the service; and
 - d. A list of research, scholarly activities and professional practice performed by the candidate, with sufficient detail to allow the Committee to evaluate its relevance to the decision.
 - ii. The candidate will provide a list of three external referees, all of whom must be at a rank equivalent to Librarian III or IV.

The Committee Chair will obtain assessments of the candidate's work from two referees, one of whom will be from the candidate's list and one of whom will be of the Committee Chair's choosing. Both referees will be arm's length to the candidate and from another institution.

The referees shall be provided with a copy of the candidate's curriculum vitae and statement (if the candidate chooses to submit a statement), and the criteria for assessment.

- iii. An optional statement prepared by the candidate providing an account of their professional, academic, and service activities and documentation providing evidence of their activities as appropriate to the criteria for permanence set out above in paragraph (54).
- iv. Copies of work that the candidate has completed, or has nearly completed, should be provided or in the case of non-written work, made known in appropriate form, to the Committee Chair. However, the candidate's permission is required before unpublished work may be communicated outside of their Committee on Permanent Status,
- v.
 - a. All annual activity reports submitted by the candidate in the course of their employment as a permanent status stream librarian at the University of Toronto;
 - b. All performance assessments conducted in the course of the librarian's employment as a permanent status stream librarian at the University of Toronto;and
 - c. At the option of the candidate, all activity reports or performance assessments conducted while the librarian held a CLTA or part-time librarian position at the University of

Toronto. The Committee Chair may also recommend that a candidate submit such performance assessments and activity reports, however these will only be provided with the agreement of the candidate.

- viii. Where a librarian has significant previous service elsewhere, external evaluation of the performance and quality of that service obtained from one or more references agreed upon by the Committee Chair and the candidate in addition to the evaluations listed above. It is also recommended that any activity reports or performance assessments conducted while the individual held a librarian position at another institution or organization be included.

Procedures

55. Each department head shall ensure that librarians who must be considered for permanent status are identified, and that Committees on Permanent Status are established and documentation prepared in order that a decision may be made not less than ninety (90) days before the anniversary date of the appointment. Each department head shall notify the candidate in writing, normally no later than eight (8) months prior to the expiration of the candidate's contract, that they will be considered for permanent status and when the process of review, including assembling of documentation, is about to begin and when it will be completed. Each candidate shall be informed of the place, time, and date of meeting of the Committee which considers their case, and shall be provided with a list of the materials, not identifying referees, provided to the Committee.
56. The Committee on Permanent Status shall meet *in camera* and each person accepting appointment to the Committee shall agree to treat as confidential all information given to the Committee and all matters pertaining to its deliberations. The quorum of the Committee shall be its full membership.
57. A summary of evidence shall be provided to the candidate, normally at least one week prior to the first meeting of the Committee, and the Committee shall give the candidate the opportunity to appear and make a statement to it (or alternatively to submit a statement in writing), but the candidate shall be excluded from all other proceedings of the Committee.

It is important that the summary be sufficiently detailed that the candidate knows the evidence before the Committee and could, if desired, supplement the dossier with a written response, or by appearing before the Committee to make a statement. The summary should include extracts of any significant information from all letters while maintaining confidentiality.
58. The Committee on Permanent Status shall have the power to take only one of two possible decisions: to recommend that appointment with permanent status be granted or that it be denied. The decision must be taken on the evidence before it: the Committee may, however, recess for a short period, normally no more than one month, to obtain additional evidence if this is considered advisable. In these circumstances, the candidate shall be provided with a supplementary summary of any additional evidence obtained and shall be given the opportunity to provide a written and/or oral statement in response. Five (5) votes out of seven (7) are required to recommend appointment with permanent status.
59. Reasons for a proposed negative recommendation shall be given to the candidate in writing, who may respond to the Committee on Permanent Status orally or in writing, within fifteen (15) days of notification of these reasons.

Thereafter, the Committee shall reconvene to make its final recommendation and shall forward it to the University Chief Librarian, with its reasons therefor, and, in the case of a negative recommendation, a summary of the evidence. The summary should be sufficiently detailed to enable the candidate to make a particular response to all of the significant components if they appeal the decision.

60. The University Chief Librarian or their designate, who shall be an appointed librarian, shall notify the department head or appropriate academic administrative head of their decision, after they have

obtained the approval of the Vice-President & Provost. The department head or appropriate academic administrative head shall in turn notify the candidate, furnishing the summary of evidence to the candidate in the event of a negative decision.

The University Chief Librarian shall also advise the candidate of the right to appeal the decision, the process for filing an appeal, and the relevant timelines.

If permanent status has been denied, the University Chief Librarian, in consultation with the appropriate academic administrative head, shall determine the duration of the candidate's terminal contract, which shall normally be for one (1) year followed by automatic termination without further review.

61. A Committee on Permanent Status shall also act as a promotion committee in the case where a candidate is a Librarian II, simultaneously recommending promotion to Librarian III and the granting of permanent status.

Appeals Against Denial of Permanent Status

62. A Librarians' Appeal Committee shall be established and shall consist of a chair and four members, appointed by the President after consultation with the Faculty Association, vacancies being filled by the same process. Members shall have a two (2)-year term after one initial one (1)-year term for half of the original appointees. The Chair shall have a two (2)-year term.

Grounds for Appeal

63. A librarian who has been denied permanent status shall have the right to appeal on one or more of the following grounds:
 - i. a significant irregularity or unfairness in the procedure followed by the Committee or in the selection of its members;
 - ii. improper bias or motive on the part of any member of the Committee;
 - iii. improper bias or motive on the part of any person whose opinion may have materially influenced the decision of the Committee; and/or
 - iv. absence of relevant material from the dossier, or the application by the Committee of inappropriate standards.

Review Procedures for Appeals

64. A candidate must give notice of appeal in writing against a denial of permanent status within thirty (30) days of the transmission to them of the statement of reasons and of the summary of the evidence considered by the Committee on Permanent Status; the Librarians' Appeal Committee shall have the power, under circumstances which it considers exceptional, to extend this time limit. The notice of appeal should be addressed to the Chair of the Librarians' Appeal Committee and should specify the grounds on which the appeal is based.
65. The candidate and the Permanent Status Committee Chair shall be given an opportunity to appear and present evidence and argument to the Librarians' Appeal Committee. If it is thought necessary, the Librarians' Appeal Committee may request that an independent investigator be appointed to assist it in determining matters of fact.
66. The Librarians' Appeal Committee, by the authority delegated to it by the Governing Council by the adoption of this Policy, shall make a final disposition of the appeal.
67. The appeal procedure should be completed within the period specified in the terminal contract.

Termination of Appointments with Permanent Status

68. Appointments with permanent status may be terminated by the University either:
 - i. for cause, which means:

- a. persistent neglect of or repeated refusal without sufficient cause to carry out reasonable duties and assigned responsibilities of the position held;
 - b. inability to carry out such duties and assigned responsibilities (except as noted in ii of this paragraph);
 - c. failure to maintain reasonable competence in librarianship, including, without limitation, in the execution of responsibilities;
 - d. gross misconduct;
- or
- ii. where, without fault on their part, the librarian is prevented by a cause or matter beyond their control from carrying out reasonable duties, including, without limitation, physical or mental illness or injury, except where and so long as the librarian (or their legal representative) makes no claim against the University for salary or other remuneration¹.
69. Where the University Chief Librarian (or appropriate academic administrative head, in the case of librarians outside the Central Library System) has or is presented with reason to believe that ground may exist for the termination for cause of the appointment of a librarian holding appointment with permanent status, they shall immediately notify the President of the University and request the President to appoint a Hearing Committee for the purposes set out below. If the President grants the request, they shall initiate the following procedures:
- i. An attempt shall be made to settle the matter informally at a meeting of the President, the University Chief Librarian or appropriate academic administrative head, the librarian, and a disinterested senior librarian or professor acceptable to the librarian and University Chief Librarian or equivalent.
 - ii. If the above attempt fails, the President shall inform the librarian in writing of their intention to institute proceedings for termination of appointment and shall give reasonable information as to the alleged ground for termination.
 - iii. Within fifteen (15) working days, the President and the librarian shall jointly name a Hearing Committee of two (2) librarians holding permanent status at the University of Toronto and one faculty member who shall hold tenure or continuing status at the University of Toronto. Should the librarian decline to participate in naming the Hearing Committee, it shall be done jointly by the President and the President of the University of Toronto Faculty Association, and the librarian shall be deemed to have waived all right to determine the membership of the Hearing Committee. If agreement on the membership of the Hearing Committee cannot be reached within fifteen (15) working days, a Judge of the Superior Court of Justice - Ontario who is willing to act and who is not a member of the Governing Council shall name the Hearing Committee.
 - iv. The Hearing Committee shall select, in whatever manner it deems fit, a Chair who shall inform the President and the librarian of the time and place designated for the hearing. Should the Hearing Committee be unable to select its Chair, the member with the earliest date of appointment to continuous service in a Canadian university shall become Chair and so act. The hearing shall commence within thirty (30) working days of the Committee's having been named.
 - v. The Hearing Committee shall proceed to determine, in accordance with the *Statutory Powers Procedure Act, RSO 1990, as amended*, whether a ground for termination of appointment exists. The President and the librarian shall be the parties to the proceedings. The Hearing Committee shall determine by majority vote, or if for any reason a majority vote is not possible, by the decision of its Chair, whether or not a ground for termination exists. This determination shall be final and not subject to appeal.
 - vi. If the Hearing Committee determines that a ground for termination of appointment exists, the President may recommend termination to the Governing Council. If the Hearing

¹ It is understood and agreed that paragraph 68(ii) of the PFL refers only to circumstances that specifically relate to an individual librarian's employment that result in a frustration of the employment contract (e.g., injury or illness, incarceration etc.) and does not include budgetary circumstances (e.g., fiscal stringency, financial exigency, or budgetary reduction or change etc.); restructuring (e.g., disestablishment, amalgamation, relocation, or closure of a library etc.); environmental or health and safety hazards (e.g., natural disaster, snow closures etc.); or other broader circumstances affecting the environment in which the librarian works (e.g., lockdown, infrastructure failure, etc.).

Committee determines that a ground for termination does not exist but that misconduct has taken place, it may impose one or more of the lesser sanctions prescribed in the *Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters* of the University for offences committed by the librarian. No further or other action shall be taken against the librarian.

Contractually Limited-Term Appointments

70. Librarians hired on contractually limited-term appointments will have the length of appointment, rank and salary clearly stated in a letter of appointment. Contractually limited-term appointments (CLTAs) should normally be used only in hiring for special projects of limited duration or for temporary replacements for librarians on leave.

Librarians hired as CLTAs shall normally be appointed at the rank of Librarian I or II. In exceptional circumstances, librarians hired as CLTAs may be appointed at the rank of Librarian III or IV.

71. For librarians appointed to a permanent status stream position immediately following a CLTA, the date of consideration for permanent status will be established at the time of the appointment to the permanent status stream position. The time spent by the librarian in the CLTA will be taken into account in establishing the date for consideration for permanent status.
72. Librarians should not normally be on CLTA for less than six (6) months or more than three (3) consecutive years.

Where the University seeks to extend a non-externally funded CLTA position for more than three (3) years (regardless of the number of librarians who have filled that position), the University Chief Librarian shall seek the approval of the Vice-President & Provost, including providing an articulation of the basis for the continuation of a temporary position.

73. A CLTA librarian may apply for any posted appointments, including those that are described as permanent status stream.
74. A CLTA librarian will normally be notified whether their contract will be renewed at least three (3) months prior to the end date of their existing contract.

If the University decides not to renew a CLTA librarian for reasons other than dismissal for cause (as defined in paragraph 68), the University shall give working notice of such decision to the librarian, or payment in lieu thereof, in accordance with the following schedule:

- (i) Where the CLTA librarian has been employed at the University continuously for six (6) to twelve (12) months, at least one (1) month prior to the end of the CLTA.
- (ii) Where the CLTA librarian has been employed at the University continuously for more than twelve (12) months and less than three (3) years, at least four (4) months prior to the end of the CLTA.

The foregoing notice may be provided at the outset of the appointment in the appointment letter.

In addition to the notice provisions above, severance pay, if any, will be provided with the greater of: two (2) weeks per completed year of service as a CLTA librarian up to a maximum of twenty-six (26) weeks or as provided and in accordance with the Ontario *Employment Standards Act, 2000*, as amended from time to time.

In calculating a CLTA librarian's period of employment at the University for the purposes of notice and severance, time spent on leave (such as pregnancy and disability leave) or other inactive employment is included in determining their period of employment. However, such periods of leave or inactive employment shall not be counted towards the normal three (3)-year maximum for CLTAs.

Research and Study Leave

75. All full-time librarians having permanent status shall be eligible to apply for research leave or study leave as set out in Article 4 of the MOA.

Appointment of Department Heads and Senior Librarian Administrators

76. The appointment of the UTL department heads, senior librarian administrators (Associate University Librarians within the Central Library System, and librarians having comparable responsibilities outside the Central Library System such as the Chief Librarians at UTM and UTSC) will be made by the University Chief Librarian. For administrative appointments outside the Central Library System, the University Chief Librarian shall consult with the academic administrative head of the division in which the appointment is made.
77. All department head and senior librarian administrator appointments in the UTL shall be for fixed terms, which shall be renewable without limit.
78. Senior librarian administrator appointments within the Central Library System shall be made by the University Chief Librarian on terms and conditions which they shall determine.

Advisory Committees for Department Heads and Senior Librarian Administrators

79. In appointing department heads and senior librarian administrators, the University Chief Librarian shall establish Advisory Committees for Department Heads and Senior Librarian Administrators (“Advisory Committees”) which shall make recommendations to them regarding such appointments. These Advisory Committees shall consider for appointment all persons known to be available to fill the position through nominations and applications, using as criteria for selection: the professional and administrative abilities and experience of the potential appointee, and their capacity for leadership in librarianship. Advisory Committees shall give particular consideration to the need for administrative continuity within the UTL.

In advance of forming Advisory Committees, the University Chief Librarian or the appropriate academic administrative head shall circulate an announcement of the Advisory Committee within the UTL and seek volunteers and nominations to sit on the Advisory Committee.

80. The formation and membership of Advisory Committees established as set out above shall be made known throughout the UTL and nominations and applications for the positions invited. Should the availability of a position be externally advertised, a simultaneous internal advertisement shall be required.
81. Should a member of any Advisory Committee be seriously considered as a potential appointee to the position on which the Advisory Committee is advising the University Chief Librarian, that member shall resign from the Advisory Committee without replacement.

Department Heads

82. Advisory Committees advising on the appointment or reappointment of department heads (or their equivalents outside the Central Library System) shall be chaired by the University Chief Librarian or their librarian designate and shall include as members: the senior librarian administrator for the area (or, in the case of appointments outside the Central Library System, the academic administrative head of the division concerned or their designate); the head of a related department; three librarians, two of whom shall, wherever possible, be from the department or area concerned, and normally at least two of these three librarians shall have permanent status; two non-librarians selected from employees of the department or area; and a faculty member who shall hold tenure or continuing status. The members of the Advisory Committee shall be appointed by the University Chief Librarian in consultation with the Associate University

Librarian or academic administrative head concerned. Such Advisory Committees shall meet *in camera*, and each of their members shall agree to treat as confidential all information given to the Advisory Committee and all matters pertaining to its deliberations. This shall not, however, be taken to prevent members of the Advisory Committee from eliciting from colleagues information and opinion which may be of use to the Advisory Committee.

83. The term of appointment as a department head shall not exceed five years.

Senior Librarian Administrator Appointments

84. For senior librarian administrators (Associate University Librarians within the Central Library System, and librarians having comparable responsibilities outside the Central Library System such as the Chief Librarians at UTM and UTSC) and other than that of the University Chief Librarian, the Advisory Committee shall be chaired by the University Chief Librarian, and shall include one faculty member who shall hold tenure or continuing status (from the division concerned if the appointment is outside the Central Library System), one Associate University Librarian or equivalent, one library department head or equivalent, four librarians (normally at least three of whom shall have permanent status), and three persons who are not librarians. The Advisory Committee shall be appointed by the University Chief Librarian in consultation with the Vice-President & Provost, other academic administrative officers concerned, and senior colleagues, bearing in mind the need for broad representation along the lines prescribed for Advisory Committees charged with advising on the appointment of department heads. The provisions relating to confidentiality outlined for committees on the appointment of department heads shall apply with equal force to Advisory Committees established under this paragraph.
85. The term of appointment of senior librarian administrators above the position of department head shall not exceed seven (7) years.

The University Chief Librarian

86. The appointment of the University Chief Librarian shall be recommended by the President on the advice of a search committee chaired by the Vice-President & Provost or their designate, with an additional twelve members, of whom no fewer than seven shall be appointed from within the UTL, and of whom no fewer than four shall be librarians in this University (normally at least three of whom shall have permanent status). The Committee shall also include a faculty member who shall hold tenure or continuing status and one or more students. The Committee shall be appointed by the Vice-President & Provost and shall be as representative of the University community as is feasible.
87. The term of appointment of the University Chief Librarian shall be that recommended by the President and approved by the Governing Council, which should be not less than seven (7) nor more than ten (10) years.
88. The formation and membership of the search committee for a University Chief Librarian of the University shall be made widely known throughout the University.

Acting Appointments

89. Nothing in the foregoing shall be taken to preclude the appointment by the University Chief Librarian of acting department heads or senior librarian administrators normally for periods of not more than one (1) year, nor the appointment by the President of an Acting University Chief Librarian for such a period as they may recommend and the Governing Council approve.

Transitional Provisions

90. The following paragraph applies to permanent status stream librarians appointed prior to January 1, 2024: Appointed permanent status stream librarians who undergo a permanent status review prior to January 01, 2024 will do so in accordance with the criteria and procedures in the 1978 PFL.

Appointed permanent status stream librarians who undergo a permanent status review on or after January 01, 2024, will, by default, undergo a permanent status review in accordance with the criteria and procedures in the 1978 PFL; however, where the librarian requests, in writing, they may elect to undergo the permanent status review in accordance with the criteria and procedures in the 2024 PFL.

Permanent status stream librarians appointed on or after January 01, 2024, who undergo a permanent status review will be subject to the criteria and procedures in the 2024 PFL.

91. Searches for new librarians and for department heads/senior librarian administrators commenced prior to January 01, 2024 will be conducted in accordance with the terms of the 1978 PFL.

Searches for new librarians and for department heads/senior librarian administrators that commence on or after January 01, 2024, will be conducted in accordance with the terms of the 2024 PFL.

92. The three (3) new Letters of Understanding regarding Scholars Portal CLTA Librarians, including Scholars Portal Recurring-Term Appointment Librarians (SPRTALS), and Research Leave or Study Leave for SPRTALS, and Secondments, will take effect on January 01, 2024. The five-year term for the LOUs on Research Leave or Study Leave for SPRTALS and on Secondments will commence on January 01, 2024, and end on December 31, 2028.
93. The requirement to post librarian positions on the University of Toronto job posting website (jobs.utoronto.ca) will be implemented by December 1, 2023.

Approved by Governing Council June 15, 1978

Amended effective July 1, 1983, section 51, research leave remuneration at 80 % salary in place of the previous 75% provision. (Arising from the agreement for salaries and benefits, 1983-84)

Amended effective July 1, 1985, section 51, to allow a librarian, after six years of continuous service, to apply for a 6-month research leave at full salary. (Arising from the agreement for salaries and benefits, 1984-5 and 1985-6, Schedule D)

Amended effective July 1, 1990, section 51, salary during research leave of 12 months shall be 82.5 % of actual salary. (Arising from the agreement for salaries and benefits, 1989-90, Schedule 4)

Amended effective July 1, 1991, section 51, to include "As an alternative and subsequent to the first leave above, a six-month leave at 82.5% salary may be granted after every three years of service provided that the leave requested under this option does not fall within seven years of the normal age of retirement." (Arising from the agreement for salaries and benefits, 1991-92 and 1992-93)

Amended effective January 1, 2024 following facilitated negotiations with the University of Toronto Faculty Association